

Syracuse City Planning Commission Meeting
July 21, 2009
Minutes

1. Meeting called to Order, Adoption of Agenda, and Approval of Minutes

Planning Commission Chair Robert Whiteley called the meeting to order at 6:06 p.m., indicating City staff posted the agenda 24 hours prior to the meeting and delivered copies to all Commission members. G.J. LaBonty offered the prayer, and Robert Whiteley led the pledge of allegiance.

Members Present: Chairman Robert Whiteley, Tena Campbell, Jamie Nagle, and Craig Jenkins as well as Community Development Director G.J. LaBonty, GIS Specialist Troy Moyes, and Administrative Assistant Judy Merrill.

Excused: Vice Chair Kenneth Hellewell and Nathan Miller

Visitors: Theron Stoker Elden Rink T.J. Jensen Ethan Moon

CRAIG JENKINS MADE A MOTION TO ADOPT THE JULY 21, 2009, AGENDA AS OUTLINED, SECONDED BY TENA CAMPBELL; ALL VOTED IN FAVOR.

There were no minutes for commissioners to review.

2. Tanner Clinic Public Hearing and Conditional Use for Signage

Theron Stoker, representing Tanner Clinic, appeared before the Planning Commission requesting Conditional Use approval to replace the existing multi-tenant monument sign, at 2038 West 1900 South, with a multi-tenant pole sign for the Tanner Clinic and Island View Pharmacy in order to provide more visibility from 1700 South. Director LaBonty explained that, based on building dimensions, the total allowable signage for this lot would be 331.12 square feet. The proposed pole sign would use only 84.73 square feet. The applicant went before the Architectural Review Committee on July 14, 2009. The Committee had concerns that the stucco finish would not closely match the brick and stone of the existing building and suggested the applicant enclose the entire base of the sign, up to its underside, in a similar brick and stone used on the primary structure. The applicant agreed to make that change, so the Committee unanimously approved the modified sign request.

Mr. Stoker wished to clarify their position. About ten years ago, Tanner Clinic decided to establish a sense of consistency with their monument signs in three different locations in order to provide more visibility, similar to larger corporations with multiple locations. This was their motivating factor behind updating this existing monument sign in Syracuse. They started about five years ago with the Clinic in Kaysville and two other areas, and he hoped to continue that new look here. The Committee changed their request a little bit with a proposal for more brick. He referred to the three options displayed to commissioners and said that he hoped to do more of a brick-matching base, such as Option 1, to help tie in the sign with the building. He believed this Option still kept the corporate look of the entire sign as opposed to Options 2 and 3 with brick inside or along the pole of the sign, which he felt detracted from the effort to stay consistent with the corporate look. He asked for approval of Option 1 rather than 2 or 3.

Commissioner Jenkins referred to Option 1 and asked if Tanner Clinic wanted the center part to look like the other new signs and if the color of the lower part was more important or significant than the actual sign and logo. Mr. Stoker explained how the identification of the clinic itself and their other tenant, Island View Pharmacy, was certainly the focal point, but they also wanted the sign structure embodying those logos to be consistent with their other clinics. They were currently updating the monument sign in Layton as well.

Commissioner Nagle asked if the primary structure contained any stucco or if it was all just brick and stone. Mr. Stoker was unsure but guessed there would be less than five percent if it had any stucco at all. Most of the building contained brick and masonry stones.

Chairman Whiteley opened up the meeting for public hearing.

Elden Rink, of Intermountain Electric Sign, approached the Commission stating that he might have misunderstood the Committee's recommendations. He remembered the first suggestions about changing this sign as being the addition of brick approximately a quarter of the way up the display. Someone else said they wanted even more and recommended brick halfway up the pole, which was why he proposed the planter area

or brick wall. His company hoped the Commission would agree that one of the proposed options contained enough brick and stone while allowing Tanner Clinic to retain the identification panel that matched their other signs.

Mr. Stoker asked if the City would have required Tanner Clinic to change their existing monument sign to match the building if they were not replacing it with a pylon sign. Director LaBonty advised him that the requirements only applied to new signs.

Chairman Whiteley then closed the public hearing.

Commissioner Jenkins asked the applicants if the proposed options were a deliberate change from the agreement with the Committee to enclose the entire base in brick and stone, which the minutes reflected the Committee unanimously approved. Mr. Rink explained that, when they asked him to add brick and stone, someone said just a couple of feet. He was confident the next suggestion was only halfway up the sign. Commissioner Jenkins read the minutes and asked Mr. Rink if they were incorrect. Mr. Rink believed they were indeed wrong and that someone recommended just a few feet of brick on the bottom. Someone else then said they wanted a little more, so he created Option 3 with brick about halfway up the pole. Chairman Whiteley, who attended that meeting, did not recall anyone saying just a few feet of brick. He remembered the Committee recommending a change to the whole base of the column from stucco to more of a brick/corner stone appearance. He considered the proposed options as an attempt to compromise by integrating both. He appreciated their desire to create consistency among building signs, but the one in Kaysville looked fitting because it matched the color and style of the building. This Clinic in Syracuse had a different color and look. Keeping the same logo and sign panel shape made sense, but he thought it beneficial to change the materials and color of the sign's structure.

Commissioner Jenkins asked again about their desire to match the base of the sign with their signs in other locations versus Syracuse City's concern with matching the building. The minutes from the Architectural Review Committee indicated that Intermountain Electric Sign agreed to match the entire base of the sign in brick and stone. Mr. Stoker suggested that Option 2 seemed to fit the requirements of the Committee, based on those minutes, more so than Option 1. Chairman Whiteley pointed out that Option 2 did not have corner stones like the building. The Tanner Clinic looked beautiful, and tying the sign into that would help bring it all together. The Ordinance required signs to look similar to their primary structures. Commissioner Nagle indicated that this requirement was the reason she asked about stucco on the building. Although Options 1 or 2 could be attractive signs in other locations, they would not match this one since the building did not contain any stucco. Option 3 aesthetically matched the building, but the stucco would not blend in and would detract, rather than add, to it.

Mr. Stoker suggested that any approval of a design then would not match their desires. Since it had to comply with Ordinance, he asked to return to the Committee. Chairman Whiteley advised him that the Commission could send them back to the Committee or just table it for further consideration.

Commissioner Nagle then asked if their point of concern was aesthetics or cost associated with brick. Mr. Stoker advised her that, although brick would raise the price, it was more of a corporate consistency issue. By having the same look at each building, people driving by would identify it as Tanner Clinic much like the red, white, and blue Intermountain signs that patrons recognized regardless of the building's appearance. Their signs on the corner were always the same and provided consistency, and Tanner Clinic wanted to follow suit. He did not disagree with the City's Master Plan or the Commission's efforts and admitted that the stucco would not match the building. Now, they just had to weigh between corporate consistency and a nice look.

Commissioner Jenkins offered to make a motion to table their request to give them time to develop something that matched the building and requirements of the Town Center Master Plan. Mr. Stoker accepted.

Commissioner Campbell advised him that she did not like Option 3 and recommended they not continue that corner stone and brick look all the way up the pillar, although it would match the building better. She suggested combining Options 1 and 2 with the brick insert on the inside of the stucco and maybe a pedestal look at the bottom with corner stones. Mr. Stoker asked if commissioners liked any of the three options. Commissioner Jenkins did not, although he liked the brick at the very top on Option 2 but not the bottom with the brick only in the center of the stucco.

Commissioner Nagle understood how hard it was to do business right now and did not want to be an obstacle for Tanner Clinic; however, she knew these times would not last forever. The decisions they made today would be far reaching. Although their sign was not awful, she did not think it matched their attractive building and wanted to make sure their decision would be a success for both Tanner Clinic and Syracuse.

CRAIG JENKINS MOVED TO TABLE THIS CONDITIONAL USE REQUEST FOR THE PLACEMENT OF A MULTI-TENANT POLE SIGN AT 2038 WEST 1900 SOUTH FOR TANNER CLINIC UNTIL THEY COULD MEET ALL REQUIREMENTS OF THE SYRACUSE LAND USE ORDINANCE SPECIFIC TO SIGNAGE. TENA CAMPBELL SECONDED THE MOTION; ALL VOTED IN FAVOR.

Mr. Rink asked to make some final comments. He indicated his company worked with all the municipalities along the Wasatch Front. The ordinances changed with each one, and they tried to comply with every requirement. Upon submittal of their very first drawing, he was told that Tanner Clinic was on the border and probably just outside the Town Center boundaries. Had he known at that time that the Clinic was within those boundaries, they would have designed this with brick. They did not come in and try to sell the City something that did not fit. As of the meeting last Tuesday, he understood that the City just moved the Clinic from outside to within the boundaries. He would be more than willing to redesign the sign to comply but asked if they could take even a smaller planter than shown in the options and carry the brick upward. Commissioner Campbell indicated that she thought Option 3 looked too busy with the corner stone and brick and preferred the base to be spread out with the narrow brick before following up with stucco.

3. Bajio's Mexican Grill Restaurant Public Hearing and Conditional Use for Signage

Ethan Moon, of Summit Signs in Orem, came forward requesting Conditional Use approval to place signage on a multi-tenant building for the Bajio Mexican Grill Restaurant, located at 2108 West 1700 South Suite 1. Based on building dimensions for Suite 1, Director LaBonty advised the Commission that the allowable square footage for signage would be 200 square feet. The proposed signs would use only 86.72 square feet. The Architectural Review Committee unanimously approved the requested signs on July 14, 2009.

Chairman Whiteley opened up the meeting for public hearing. No one came forward, so he closed the public hearing and asked when the Restaurant planned to open. Mr. Moon was unsure but thought it would be within the next sixty days. Commission Nagle pointed out that the Restaurant owner told the City Council last Tuesday, when receiving approval for a beer license, that it would be four to six weeks.

TENA CAMPBELL MADE A MOTION TO GRANT CONDITIONAL USE APPROVAL FOR THE PLACEMENT OF BUILDING SIGNAGE AT 2107 WEST 1700 SOUTH SUITE 1 FOR THE BAJIO MEXICAN GRILL RESTAURANT SUBJECT TO ALL REQUIREMENTS OF THE SYRACUSE LAND USE ORDINANCE SPECIFIC TO SIGNAGE. JAMIE NAGLE SECONDED THE MOTION; ALL VOTED IN FAVOR.

4. Discussion of 200 South Corridor Area Planning

Chairman Whiteley recommended that the Commission table this item until they were more prepared to address it.

CRAIG JENKINS MOVED TO TABLE THIS ITEM, SECONDED BY JAMIE NAGLE; ALL VOTED IN FAVOR.

5. Planning Commission Business

Commissioner Nagle attended the last City Council meeting and reported on Tera Bennett's request for land to develop a playground accessible to children with disabilities. She formed a nonprofit group to raise funds for the playground equipment but needed the City to donate land and maintain the park. The Council was very supportive of her request and recommended a couple of areas on which to locate this playground. The Council had a lot of discussion about the proposed Syracuse Carwash on 2000 West. Councilman Hammond recused himself because the applicant was his son. They discussed concerns with parking, flow of traffic, and its impact on the Iceberg Restaurant. They eventually took a vote and granted site plan approval. Councilman Clark voted nay. The Council also granted site plan approval for the Iceberg

Restaurant and a Class B beer license for the Bajio Mexican Grill Restaurant. The applicant for the Bajio Restaurant said they would also have a frozen daiquiri or margarita machine. Director LaBonty explained how the City just issued licenses to serve these drinks but State law governed the establishments selling such alcohol. Commissioner Nagle finished by reporting that the Council approved the amended General Plan and Current Zoning maps.

Chairman Whiteley attended the Council work session and reported on some of the items discussed. They clarified the ordinance, regarding compensation for commission members, by changing it to say “as determined by City Council.” This correction would maintain the existing rate and make the current process more legally sound. They discussed ways to boost volunteerism in the community and generate more businesses while retaining the existing establishments. One idea was to create a business rotary similar to those in other cities so that business owners, rather than City staff, would be in control.

Commissioner Jenkins was to attend the next Council meeting, but he advised Chairman Whiteley that he would be out of town.

Commissioner Campbell asked Director LaBonty about the status of filling the vacant seat on the Commission. He told her the Mayor extended an invitation to someone but did not know if they responded yet. Chairman Whiteley understood the appointment would be on the next Council agenda.

Chairman Whiteley formally thanked Evert Cook for his service on the Commission. The position took a lot of time, and it became too difficult for him to balance it with his work schedule.

Commissioner Campbell reminded everyone of their discussion during the previous work session regarding the election of a Chair and Vice Chair. She nominated Robert Whiteley to continue as Chair and Kenneth Hellewell to continue as Vice Chair. Jamie Nagle seconded the motion; all voted in favor.

6. Adjournment

CRAIG JENKINS MADE A MOTION TO ADJOURN AT 6:42 P.M.; ALL VOTED IN FAVOR.

Robert Whiteley
Planning Commission Chair